Human Resource Development and Supervision as Effective Strategies for Improving Business Education Curriculum in Colleges of Education for Employability of Graduates

Chika Madu Ile
cm.ile@unizik.edu.ng
Department of Business Education
Faculty of Vocational and Technology Education
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka
&
Maryvivian Chinyere Oko
okomaryvivian@gmail.com
Department of Business Education
Faculty of Vocational and Technology Education
Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka

Abstract
The study focused on human resource development and supervision as effective strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education in South-East Nigeria for employability of graduates. Two research questions guided the study while two hypotheses were tested at 0.05 level of significance. Descriptive survey research design was adopted for the study. The population of the study consisted of 320 business educators from colleges of education. The study utilized a validated four-point scale questionnaire with a reliability index of 0.74 and 0.87. The overall reliability test was 0.78 for data. The data collected were analyzed using arithmetic mean and standard deviation. The result from the study indicated that adequate human capital development and constant supervision were effective strategies for improving business education curriculum in colleges of education for employability of graduates. Based on the findings, the study recommended that there was need for proper training and retraining of business educators in colleges of education as well as constant supervision of instructions in colleges of education in Nigeria.

Keywords: Human Resources, Development, Effective Strategies, Business Education, Curriculum

Introduction
One of the courses offered in colleges of education is business education. Business Education is an educational programme that prepares students for entry and advancement in jobs within business and to handle their business affairs as well as to function intelligently as consumers and citizens in a business economy. Osuala (2004) defined business education as that aspect of vocational education, that emphasizes job competency, career preparation, and work

adjustments. It involves acquisition of special skills in business subject areas. Njoku (2021) defines business education as an educational programme that equips individuals with functional and sustainable skills, knowledge, attitude and value that would enable the individuals operate in the environment such individuals find themselves.

The curriculum content of business education programme consists of different courses with different objectives; accounting, OTM, marketing, etc. These courses formed the curriculum contents of Business Education programme at the College of Education level with the aim of helping to bring about the desired behavior in the learner (Inegbedion, Njoku & Ekpeyoung, 2009).

Although business education programme equips individual with necessary skills for self-employment, its graduates are yet to maximize these opportunities in creating jobs for themselves and others instead, they roam the streets in search of jobs, which are either few in supply or not available. Even the few graduates who try to establish businesses, before now, the businesses have collapsed because of poor location, lack of creative thinking, communication, marketing and keeping of accounting records (Okereke 2021). All these can be attributed to poor curriculum implementation (Njoku, 2021). Thus, the need to examine strategies for business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability.

Strategies refer to various ways of carrying out a particular task. According to Makaj and Ikonne (2016), strategy is an action that managers take to attain one or more of an organization's goals. Strategy can also be defined as a general direction set for a company and its various components to achieve desired state in the future. Strategy results from the detailed strategic planning process. In the context of this study, strategies refer to plans of actions to achieve short, middle and long-term desired goals of skill acquisition in business education programme in colleges of education for development. Such strategies include funding, provision of instructional materials, provision of information and communication technologies, field trips, designing and implementation of in-service training programmes for business educators in colleges of education among others (Ebe, 2021). In line with this, Nwosu and Onyemaobi (2021) opined that some strategies like improving synergy and collaboration with private sector, instructional supervision, administrative supervision, supportive supervision, and evaluative supervision and equitable distribution of funds among others have been suggested as effective in improving the quality of business education.

Scholars such as Azubuike (2019), Ebe (2021) and Okoro (2022) have suggested entrepreneurial strategies, human resource development strategies and supervision are considered effective for improving vocational education courses for sustainable employability of graduates of colleges of education in Nigeria. Business education is among vocational education courses. It therefore means that the application of these strategies might help in improving employability of business education graduates of colleges of education in Nigeria. However, this study focused on human resource development strategies and supervision for improving employability of graduates of colleges of education in Nigeria.

Human resource development is the process of increasing the knowledge, skills, and capacities of all people in an organisation. Human resources development refers to the vast field of training and development provided by organizations to increase the knowledge, skills, education, and abilities of employees. In many organizations, the human resources development process begins upon the hiring of a new employee and continues throughout that employee's tenure with the organization. According to Izuchukwu (2019), human resource development

involves improving the effectiveness of organizations through in-service training, motivation of workers individually and collectively. Developing business educators through training may be viewed as related to immediate changes in educational effectiveness through organized instruction, while development is related to the progress of longer-term business educators which will in-turn help in improving students' skills and aptitude for self-employment and job creation.

Supervision refers to acts of giving direction, guidance and control of working force with a view to seeing that they are working according to plan and are keeping time schedule (Izuchukwu, 2019). Supervision in school is done by educational supervisors. An educational supervisor is an experienced and knowledgeable professional who provides guidance, support, and supervision to educators and educational institutions. Their role is multifaceted and encompasses various responsibilities, including curriculum development, instructional leadership, teacher evaluation, and professional development. Educational supervisors work closely with teachers, administrators, and other stakeholders to promote effective teaching practices, enhance student's outcomes, and ensure adherence to educational standards and policies. In the context of this study supervision is essentially the practice of monitoring the performance of school staff, noting the merits and demerits and using befitting and harmonious techniques to amend the flaws while still improving on the merits thereby increasing the standard of schools and achieving educational goals. Educational supervisors play a crucial role in curriculum development and implementation. They work closely with teachers and administrators to ensure that the curriculum is aligned with educational standards, goals, and the needs of students.

From the forgoing, the adoption of critical strategies would be crucial to effective implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education for employability of graduates. Although it is yet unknown whether there is disparity between state governments owned colleges of education and federal government owned colleges of education. as these strategies have not been proven to improve the quality of business education for employability of business education graduates. It is against this background that the study ascertained the human resource development and supervision/monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates.

Statement of the Problem

One of the goals of Nigeria Certificate of Education (NCE) business education programme is the acquisition of skills which will enable graduates to be self-reliant and useful members of the society. It is the statutory duty of the Nigerian higher education to groom the required human capital through relevant manpower training, abilities, attitudes, skills and knowledge. An outstanding human capital assumption is that after finishing formal tertiary education, graduates should be able to make a successful transition from these institutions of higher learning to become productive workers, self-reliant entrepreneurs, responsible parents, good citizens, selfless leaders, and live healthy lives. It is assumed, also that on graduation, young people would have developed additional skills through training and experience that could further enhance their opportunities, capabilities and success in their life endeavor. In spite of available business opportunities, and conducive environment for businesses to thrive in southeast Nigeria, business education graduates are yet to maximize these opportunities, by using their creative abilities in creating jobs for themselves and others. Instead, the business graduates go about the streets in search of jobs, which are either few in supply or not available. This means that either the curriculum is inadequate or that there is poor human resource development as well

as poor supervision/monitoring of instructions in the colleges of education. It is based this that this study examined human resource development and supervision/monitoring strategies as effective strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates

Purpose of the Study

The main purpose of the study was to examine human resource development and supervision/monitoring strategies as effective strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates. Specifically, the study determined:

1. Human resource development as an effective strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for sustainable employability of graduates.
2. Supervision and monitoring as an effective strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates

Research Questions

The following research questions guided the study

1. What are human resource development strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates?

2. What are the supervision and monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses were tested at 0.05 level of significance;

1. There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of human resource development strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates
2. There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of supervision and monitoring strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates

Methods

The study adopted descriptive survey research which involved gathering data using questionnaire. The population of the study consisted of 320 business educators from public colleges of education in south-east Nigeria. The study utilized a validated four-point scale questionnaire with a reliability index of 0.78 for data collection. The researchers with the help of two research assistants administered and collected copies of the instrument from the respondents. Data collected for the study were analyzed using arithmetic mean and standard deviation. Any item with a mean rating of 2.50 and above was regarded as effective while mean ratings less than 2.50 were regarded as not effective. For the hypotheses, any item with t-calculated value greater than critical value was rejected, otherwise the hypothesis of no significant difference was accepted.

Results

Research Question 1: What are human resource development strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates?

Table 1: Mean rating on the human resource development strategies for improving Business Education curriculum implementation in colleges for employability of graduates N = 320

S/N	Human resources strategies	$\bar{x}$	SD	Remark
1	Organize regular staff meetings to encourage active communication flow between management and staff	3.13	0.98	HE
2	Appraising workers	3.34	0.80	HE
3	Worker promotion	3.06	1.07	HE
4	Install information gadgets such as internet mass, fax, intercom, email, for easy access to necessary information	3.51	0.73	VHE
5	Encourage staff members from participating in decisions that affect them	3.01	0.82	HE
6	Promote clear communication flow among staff members to enhance institutions' growth	3.49	0.68	HE
7	Delegate deans, heads of departments/units to provide adequate supervision to staff	3.28	0.98	HE
8	Withhold demoralising/despondent information from staff members	3.33	0.67	HE
9	Encourage easy communication flow between management and staff.	3.02	1.04	HE
10	Adopt appropriate channel of communication in reaching out to the entire school community	3.18	1.04	HE
11	Provision of good working office would enable business educators to carry-out their dutiful responsibilities	3.29	0.82	HE
12	Grant study leave to members willing to go for training/development	3.53	0.64	VHE
13	Provide research allowances to encourage staff members to undertake research-oriented activities	2.86	0.83	HE
14	Support staff members to carry out educational research and publish the findings	3.41	0.70	HE
15	Attend refresher courses to enhance professional growth	3.35	0.58	HE

Table 1 shows mean ratings of human resource development as an effective for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates. The Table shows that two items (1 and 15) are rated very highly effective while the remaining 13 items with mean scores of 2.86 to 3.49 are rated highly effective.

Research Question 2: To What are the supervision and monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates?

Table 2: Mean responses on the supervision strategies are effective for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates N = 320

S/N	Supervision and monitoring strategies	$\bar{x}$	SD	Remark
16	Full Supervision would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.16	0.70	HE
17	Emergency Supervision would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.23	0.69	HE
18	Clinical supervision would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.11	0.83	HE
19	Routine supervision would improve business education curriculum implementation	2.94	0.95	HE
20	Investigative supervision would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.40	0.84	HE
21	Special visit would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.07	0.90	HE
22	Pre-opening of school visits would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.20	0.93	HE
23	Assessment visit would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.43	0.80	HE
24	Follow-up visit would improve business education curriculum implementation	3.14	1.10	HE

Table 2 shows the mean ratings of supervision and monitoring as effective strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates. The Table reveals that all the nine items are rated 2.94 to 3.43 are rated highly effective. The standard deviation ranging from 0.69- 1.10 also shows that the responses are not far from each other

Hypothesis 1

There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of human resource development strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates.

Table 3: t-test summary of the Mean Ratings of Business Educators on the Effectiveness of Human Resource Development Strategies for Improving Business Education Curriculum Implementation in Colleges of Education Based on Institution Ownership

Siting of residence	N	Mean	Std. D	Df	t-cal	p-value	Decision
State	131	3.261	.3660	318	.195	.659	Not Significant
Federal	189	3.248	.3774				

Table 3 shows no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of human resource development strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates as the t-cal is .195 and the p-value (.659) is greater than the stipulated 0.05 level of significance. Therefore, the null hypothesis is accepted. Thus, there is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of human resource development strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of s graduates.

Hypothesis 2

There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of supervision and monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates.

Table 4: t-test summary of the Mean Ratings of Business Educators on the Effectiveness of Supervision and Monitoring Strategies for Improving Business Education Curriculum Implementation in Colleges of Education Based on Institution Ownership.

Siting of residence	N	Mean	Std. D	Df	t-cal	p-value	Decision
State	131	3.186	.353	318	.100	.752	Not Significant
Federal	189	3.186	.354				

Table 4 shows no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of supervision and monitoring as a strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates as the t-cal is .100 and the p-value (.752) is greater than the stipulated 0.05 level of significance. Therefore, the null hypothesis is accepted. Thus, there is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of supervision and monitoring as strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates.

Discussion

The study revealed that the respondents rating on the effectiveness of human resource development strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education. The findings showed that the respondents rated organising regular staff meetings to encourage active communication flow between management and staff as well as promotion of clear communication flow among staff members to effectively enhance institutions' growth highly. Human resource coordination is very important in achieving organisational goals. This result is in accordance with Ekeh (2015) who noted that ensuring effective free flow communication among educators is very crucial to actualising educational objectives. The study also showed that the respondents rated appraising workers, workers' promotion, encourage staff members from participating in decisions that affect them high. These results are in accordance with Nwankwo and Ogbonnaya (2016) who noted that workers appraisal and motivation are very crucial in actualising organisational objectives. This, according to the Nwankwo and Ogbonnaya, is because they are the major determinants and implementers of educational curriculum and objectives.

The respondents also rated utilisation of information and communication technology tools as effective strategy for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education high. This finding agreed with Igbokwe (2021) who noted that the utilisation of information and communication technologies in teaching and learning as well as other administrative works are very important in the implementation of business education curriculum in tertiary institutions.

Furthermore, the result of the study revealed that the respondents rated highly the promotion of clear communication flow among staff members to enhance institutions' growth, delegation of deans, heads of departments/units to provide adequate supervision to staff members, withhold demoralising/despondent information from staff members, encouraging easy communication flow between management and staff, adoption appropriate channel of communication in reaching out to the entire school community, provision of good working office would enable business educators to carry-out their dutiful responsibilities, granting of study leave to members willing to go for training/development. These results are in line with Ebeh (2022) who reported that encouraging and delegating authorities to staff are strategies for improving workers (business educators) performance for the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. The study further revealed that the respondents rated high provision of research allowances to encourage staff members to undertake research-oriented activities and support staff to carry out educational research and publish the findings, attend refresher courses to enhance professional growth.

The test of the hypothesis which stated that there is no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of funding strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates was upheld. The result from the study are in tandem with Okereke (2018) who noted that manpower training and development is very important in ensuring adequate implementation of business education objectives in tertiary institutions in Nigeria.

The study equally showed that the respondents rated high, effective supervision and monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum for employability of graduates in colleges. The findings indicated that the respondents rated full supervision, emergency supervision, clinical supervision, routine supervision, investigative supervision, special visits, pre-opening of school, assessment visits and follow-up visits were highly effective for improved business education curriculum implementation. These findings are in line with Ugoh (2019) who noted that adequate supervision provides direction, develops policies, analyses teaching-learning situations, identifies problem areas, and offering solutions. All these would help in the implementation of business education curriculum. Additionally, supervision helps to enhance staff relationships, group dynamics, and educational outcomes. This result is supported by the test of the second hypothesis which showed that there was no significant difference in the mean ratings of respondents in federal and state colleges of education on the effectiveness of supervision and monitoring strategies for improving business education curriculum implementation in colleges of education for employability of graduates. This means that in both state and federal owned colleges of education, adequate supervision is very crucial for the implementation of business education objectives.

Conclusion

Based on the findings of this study, it is concluded that for business education to achieve its major purpose which is inculcating in the recipients the spirit of self-reliance that will lead to poverty alleviation, there is need to come up with strategies that will assure effective implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. This study demonstrates that adequate human resource development and adequate supervision and monitoring strategies could be used for improving business education curriculum for employability of graduates in colleges of education in South East Nigeria.

Recommendations

Based on the findings, discussions and conclusions of the study, the following recommendations are made:

1. Management of colleges of education in Nigeria should ensure that they provide proper training and retraining of business educators in the colleges of education in Nigeria. This is to ensure that they are properly equipped with the right skills and knowledge that are required in the labour market which they will transfer to the students.
2. Management of colleges of education should ensure proper supervision and monitoring of instruction in their institutions. This will help ensure that the business educators are regular to classes and use the right methods to teach the students.

References

Agocha, O.A. and Okobia, S.O. (2018). Factors militating against effective application of computer skills by confidential secretaries in business offices in Minna metropolis, Niger State: *Business Education Journal*: 6 (2): 59 – 65

Azih, N. (2013). Capacity building in modern office technology: An imperative for effective secretarial productivity. *Asian Journal of Business Management* 5(2) 193-196.

Azubuike, C. A (2019). Challenges of a professional secretary: need for curriculum revision in Nigerian Polytechnics. *International Journal of Business Education* 3(3), 38.

Carl, Z. (2018). Perceptions of Vocational Educators and Human Resources/Training and Development Professional Regarding Skill Dimension of School-to-Work Transition Programs. *Journal of Vocational and Technical Education, Vol. 15,* No. I., Indiana State University. kswortzel@ais.msstate.edu.

Chinasa, C. (2000). *Teaching method and procedures*. Onitsha: Techson Publishers Limited.

Damko, A.I. (2006). Entrepreneurship education for vocational and technical students. *Paper presented to the department of Vocational and Technical Education Hamada Bello University, Zaria.*

Ebe (2021) The Role of Colleges of Education in National Development. In Ehiametalor, E.T. (ed) *Education and National Development,* Benin-City: Nigerian Educational Research Association.

Ebeh, M A (2022). *Mechanisms for Improving Manpower Production in Vocational and Technical Education. Akoka Journal of Education. 1 (2) 165 – 178*

Ehiametalor, E.J. (2018) *Educational and National Development.* Benin-City: Nigeria Educational Research Council.

Ekong, I., Igbo, L. L., Onyemaechi, S., Nwachukwu, T and Olaitan, S. O (2004). *Development and utilization of facilities for home economic education program in Nigerian schools and colleges for manpower development. Nigerian Vocational Journal 2(1), 16 – 24*

Ezeji E. U. (2002). *Development and utilization of facilities for home economic education program in Nigerian schools and colleges for manpower development. Nigerian Vocational Journal 2(1), 16 – 24.*

Ibrahim, A. B. (2006). Modernisation of secretarial education curriculum for meeting the challenges of 21st century's technology. *International Journal of Research in Education. 3(1), 97*

Igbokwe, S O (2021). *Alternative strategies of funding secondary education in Imo State (A case study of Okigwe educational zone)*. Unpublished M.Ed. Thesis, Department of Education, University of Nigeria, Nsukka.

Inegbedion, E. D., Njoku, I E & Ekpeyoung, S (2009). *Education and Modernization in Asia.* California: Addison Wesley Publishing Company.

Izuchukwu, J. A (2019), The technological changes in business education. *International Journal of Business Education* 2(3) 76-89.

Maaji, S. A. (2013). An Assessment of Vocational Technical Training Programmes in Nigeria Prisons of Selected Northern Nigerian Prisons. *An Unpublished Doctoral Thesis* Department of Vocational Teacher Education; University of Nigeria.

Makaj and Ikonne (2016) Business education as a tool for achieving the millennium development goals in Nigeria. *A paper presented at the national conference of business students association held at Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria*.

Makaj, N E and Ikonne, V (2016). *Education Strategy for Developing Societies,* London: Tavistock.

National Board for Technical Education (2004). *Curriculum and course specification (ND and HND) in office technology and management*. Kaduna: Atman ltd.

Njoku, F R (2021). The Changing Role of the Teacher in Contemporary Nigerian Society. Being an Unpublished Invited Guest Speech at the Opening Ceremony of the Quadri-Ennial Benue State Wing Delegates Conference of the Nigerian Union of Teachers Held at Makurdi, Benue State, on 3rd Aprial.

Nwosu B and Onyemaobi, G (2021) Factors responsible for poor performance of work and study students in pitman shorthand and typewriting in the department of business education. *Unpublished B.Sc Project Presented to the Department of Business Education*; Anambra State University, Abakaliki.

Okereke, S C (2021). *The Permanent Function in Educational Administration.* New York: The Macmillan Company.

Okoro, V. (2022) *Good teaching: the top ten requirements.* Ontario: New York University Press.

Osuala E. C (2004) *Improving business teacher education for skill development in Nigeria*, Nsukka; Fulladu Company.

Ugoh, J.O. (2019). Financing education in Nigeria under military rule (1968-1978). *Nigeria education: trends and issues*. 24-29 Ile-Ife, University of Ife Press Limited.